Discussion Prompts: Peer Review of Protocols

TL;DR: You are the reviewer. Ask your partner (the author) to briefly summarize her protocol. After the summary, **ask the questions below**—choose the most relevant ones or add your own.

Reminder: Be a **critical but constructive** reviewer. Maintain a professional and positive tone.

1. Review Type & Goal Fit

- What is the specific topic, research question, and/or objective?
- What is your review type? Is it aimed at descriptive, understanding, explaining, testing?
- Why this type? How does it fit your research question?
- Is the review goal consistent with the chosen review type?
- How does the review type influence the methodological approach (e.g., inductive vs. deductive, qualitative vs. quantitative synthesis)?

2. Methodological Steps

- **Problem formulation**: How is the scope defined and justified?
- **Search strategy**: Which databases and techniques will be used? Why these?
- **Screening**: What are your inclusion and exclusion criteria? Are they appropriate?
- **Quality assessment**: Will you assess quality or bias? How?
- **Data extraction and analysis**: Are you using inductive coding, vote counting, or meta-analysis? Does the analysis align with the review type and research question?
- How will transparency and replicability be ensured (e.g., PRISMA, protocol registration)?

3. Contribution

- What type of contribution is expected (conceptual, theoretical, methodological, practical)?
- How will the results advance understanding (e.g., theory building, clarification of inconsistencies)?
- Are the contributions feasible given the scope and methods? Should the scope be adapted?
- Did you find published reviews on the topic? If so, how does your work complement them?

4. Internal Coherence Check

- Do the goal, review type, methods, and contribution form a coherent whole?
- Would reviewers see a clear logic from research question to outcomes?

Reflection

- Strengths highlighted by your partner.
- Aspects to reconsider or clarify.
- Next steps for refining your protocol.